

R.Ye. Kosdauletova

*Kazakh University of Technology and Business, Astana  
(E-mail: rabikal@mail.ru)*

## **The effectiveness of state programs of the Republic of Kazakhstan for the sustainable development of the national economy**

The article describes the features of the sustainability of the national economy by means of state planning system. It disclosed the nature of the relationship of strategic documents and state programs and investigated the possibility of using them to assess the development of the national economy. The instruments for implementation of state programs of the Republic of Kazakhstan, aimed at the implementation of the strategic development priorities of the country and ensuring national security are defined. The authors analyzed the list of existing state programs of the Republic of Kazakhstan, revealed the most common shortcomings of developed government programs and offered solutions to these problems.

*Key words:* national economy, state planning, the strategy, the state program, the effectiveness, instruments for implementation.

The successful development of the national economy of the Republic of Kazakhstan is impossible without its effective system of state planning. State planning system in the Republic of Kazakhstan is of great importance for the balance of the national economy, its effective and sustainable growth. The state of the national economy depends on the degree of satisfaction of the population's needs and the realization of its interests. In the administrative-command economy, a huge share of industrial production belonged to the means of production and weapons, which inevitably led to a shortage of consumer goods required to meet the needs of the people. Priority development of material production relative to the non-material sphere led to a significant backlog of services in the national economy. Serious structural problems were seen in industry, agriculture and many other sectors of the national economy.

The modern system of state planning of Kazakhstan, despite the market reforms, remains deeply deformed. Against the backdrop of economic recession, many structural problems, unfortunately, tend to yield a higher level of complexity. These circumstances make the task of converting the system of state planning of the national economy in priority.

Converting the scale of the state of the national economy planning for the implementation has long-term strategic nature and requires a comprehensive study of the problem, to rethink a number of provisions of the theory of the structure of the national economy, the analysis of new phenomena, peculiarities and contradictions in its development, consolidation and development of ways to improve the structure of the national economy. Only on this basis makes possible the progress to a socially oriented market economy and the transition from the spontaneous market of life to targeted regulation, carried out in the interests of the whole society and each of its members. All of this, in our view, determines the relevance of the present study.

At present, taking into account the internal and external challenges of the national economy the issue was sharply raised which devoted the need for managerial decision-making in terms of the economic interest and the long-term interests, to create an effective system of state planning.

State planning is becoming increasingly important for government regulation to implement the tasks set by the President of the Republic of Kazakhstan in the Address to the people of Kazakhstan the entering to 30 the most competitive countries of the world. The objective of the new system of state planning in the Republic of Kazakhstan is the enforcement of the Strategy «Kazakhstan – 2050», the Strategic Development Plan till 2020, approved by the President of the Republic of Kazakhstan and all the other strategic documents adopted for the further development of Kazakhstan. The introduction of state planning system laid down in the Decree of the Head of State dated on 18 June 2009 № 827 «On the System of state planning in the Republic of Kazakhstan».

In order to secure the basic legal approaches introduced a new results-oriented system of state planning, Decree defines the following types of documents of state planning system in the Republic of Kazakhstan:

- Development Strategy of Kazakhstan until 2050;
- Strategic Plan of Development of Kazakhstan for 10 years, Predictive scheme of spatial development;
- National Security Strategy of the Republic of Kazakhstan;

- The forecast of socio-economic development for 5 years;
- Government programs for 5–10 years;
- Sectoral programs;
- Strategic plans of state bodies for 5 years;
- Development of the program areas for 5 years;
- Development Strategy for the 10 years of National Governing holdings, national holdings, national companies with state participation in the authorized capital [1].

The success and effectiveness of long-term development strategies, national and regional programs depend not only on the development of quality, but also on their implementation mechanisms. The implementation of these documents is carried out by means of strategic plans of state bodies, strategies and plans for national holdings and companies, sectoral programs and, of course, the national and local budgets.

An important role in the stable development of the national economy of Kazakhstan play a government program that form on the basis of the developed strategic goals of the Strategic Plan of the Republic of Kazakhstan by the authorized body on state planning, taking into account proposals of interested state bodies and approved by the President of the Republic of Kazakhstan.

Table 1

**The tools of realization of the state programs of the Republic of Kazakhstan**

№	Name	Characteristics
1.	The structure of the state program	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>– Passport (main parameters);</li> <li>– Introduction;</li> <li>– Analysis of the current situation;</li> <li>– Aims, objectives, target indicators and indicators of progress in the implementation of the program;</li> <li>– The main directions, towards the attainment of the program's objectives and the appropriate measures;</li> <li>– The necessary resources.</li> </ul>
2.	Sources of funding of the program	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>– Republican and local budgets;</li> <li>– Government loans;</li> <li>– Nongovernmental loans, attracted under state guarantee;</li> <li>– Direct foreign and domestic investment;</li> <li>– Grants of international financial and economic organizations and donor countries;</li> <li>– Loans of commercial banks;</li> <li>– Own funds of organizations;</li> <li>– Other sources.</li> </ul>
3.	The monitoring of the program is carried out	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>– Public authorities responsible for the development of the state program;</li> <li>– State bodies authorized by the President of the Republic of Kazakhstan or the Head of the Presidential Administration of the Republic of Kazakhstan;</li> <li>– Other organizations, programs co-executors.</li> </ul>
4.	Assessment of the state program	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>– Carried out at the end of every three years for their implementation (intermediate) and at the end of the planning period (the final);</li> <li>– Carried out by the authorized body on state planning and the Accounts Committee for Control over Execution of the Republican Budget.</li> </ul>
5.	Control of the state program	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>– Is based on the results of monitoring, evaluation and control measures, the state audit the effectiveness of the implementation of the state program;</li> <li>– Carried out by the Administration of the President of the Republic of Kazakhstan.</li> </ul>

*Note.* Compiled by the authors on the base of [2].

According to the Table 1 data, the formation of the state program is due to the need to improve the efficiency of budget spending, ensuring the structuring of budget spending on long-term goals and objectives of government policy. Government programs in part become a logical continuation of the policy aimed at strengthening communication software tools to the strategic objectives and challenges faced by the Government of the Republic of Kazakhstan.

Government programs designed to identify the goals, objectives and instruments of state policy aimed at the implementation of the strategic development priorities of the country and ensuring national security.

Designed project of the state program must meet the following requirements:

- Designed to implement the higher instruments of state planning systems;
- Focus on the tasks of intersectoral and interdepartmental character;
- Focus on the needs of the target group beneficiaries;
- To have a system of agreed by periods, resources, and implementing objectives, target indicators, tasks and measures to ensure the achievement of the strategic objectives of the parent documents of state planning systems;
- Ensure the targeting of measures, a clear definition of the timing and sequence of their implementation, a strict focus on implementing activities to achieve program objectives;
- To ensure the balance of financial, human and material resources and sources of support;
- To be presented in short and clear format.

It is not allowed to develop a state program aimed at:

- 1) addressing particular industry or a particular region (city, area);
- 2) decision of issues inter-governmental bodies;
- 3) overlap the goals and objectives of existing government programs, as well as measures for the implementation of these programs.

The list of public programs should include programs name of the state authority which is responsible for the development of the state program and the period of implementation of government programs.

The draft list of state programs submitted for approval to the President of the Republic of Kazakhstan within one month after the approval of the Strategic Plan of Development of Kazakhstan for the coming ten-year period. During the period of implementation of the Strategic Development Plan of the Republic of Kazakhstan on the results of its monitoring and evaluation in the list of state programs is subject to appropriate amendments.

Currently, in the Republic of Kazakhstan there are 8 state programs, which were approved in order to implement the Decree of the President of the Republic of Kazakhstan dated February 1, 2010 № 922 «On the Strategic Development Plan of the Republic of Kazakhstan till 2020» (Table 2).

Table 2

List of state programs of the Republic of Kazakhstan

№	Name of the program	Developer	Period of realization
1	National program of infrastructure development «Nurly Zhol» for 2015–2019 years	Ministry of National Economy of the Republic of Kazakhstan	2015–2019
2	The state program of industrial-innovative development of Kazakhstan for 2015–2019 years	Ministry for Investment and Development of the Republic of Kazakhstan	2015–2019
3	The state program «Information Kazakhstan – 2020»	Ministry for Investment and Development of the Republic of Kazakhstan	2013–2019
4	State program on combating religious extremism and terrorism	General Prosecutor's Office of the Republic of Kazakhstan	2013–2019
5	State program on health development of the Republic of Kazakhstan «Densaulyk» for 2016–2019 years	The Ministry of Health and Social Development of the Republic of Kazakhstan	2016–2019
6	State Program for Development of Education and Science of the Republic of Kazakhstan for 2016–2019 years	The Ministry of Education and Science of the Republic of Kazakhstan	2016–2019
7	State program of development and functioning of languages in the Republic of Kazakhstan	The Ministry of Culture and Sports of the Republic of Kazakhstan	2011–2019
8	State program on water resources management in Kazakhstan	The Ministry of Agriculture of the Republic of Kazakhstan	2014–2019

Note. Compiled by the authors on the base of [3].

Kazakhstan has developed and implemented the long-term state programs. One form of programming is the development and implementation of government programs, which are calculated for the period from 5 to 10 years. That is, the documents, bearing a nationwide, interdisciplinary character. The list of such programs is limited by presidential decree of 19 March 2010, under which government programs are being developed in areas of industrial and innovative development, health, education, development and functioning of languages.

In 2015 the implementation of the state program «Kazakhstan Salamatty» has been completed. The first stage of state programs on the industrialization and development of education has been passed. At the different stages of the program there were implemented the programs of employment, regional development, agro-business 2020, transport and others.

In the reporting period, the Accounts Committee of the Republic of Kazakhstan carried out assessment of the effectiveness of government programs, the results of which showed that some state authorities - coordinators of the program must monitor and control the progress of the execution of the planned measures were not provided.

The most common shortcomings of developed government programs are:

- The incorrect description of the characteristics of the scope of implementation of state programs, the main problems in this sphere, as well as the scope of the forecast implementation of state programs;
- Mismatched the performance of government programs, not allow to assess the effectiveness of their implementation;
- The fuzzy, blurry wording of goals, objectives, indicators and expected results of government programs;
- An excessive number of tasks of government programs and sub-programs, as well as target indicators;
- Weak relationship of departmental target programs and basic activities of state programs with indicators of the state program;
- Lack of justification of state regulation measures (including legal) in the areas of implementation of state programs.

In the Address to the nation on November 30, 2015 The Head of the State outlined the measures on optimization of budget expenditures and directed the Government to conduct a full audit of all budgetary programs. In terms of the crisis every tenge is important. Inefficient costs or expenses that may be covered at the expense of the private sector should be excluded from the budget. It is necessary to reconsider the cost of the program for regional and industrial development [4].

The Head of the State instructed to reduce the number of government programs, and the «sectoral ones to remove», including them in the strategic plans and engage in «concrete big questions». According to him, results-based management will help to build a new system for evaluating the work of the state apparatus, it will be legislated access to public information, and state agencies, including the Government and the Ministry will report regularly to the public [5].

2015 was the first year of implementation of the infrastructure program «Nurly Zhol». Aims of the program are the formation of a single economic market by integrating macro-regions of the country on the basis of building an effective infrastructure hub principle for long-term economic growth in Kazakhstan, as well as the implementation of anti-crisis measures to support specific sectors of the economy in the conditions of conjuncture deterioration on external markets.

According to the Ministry of Finance of the Republic of Kazakhstan in 2015 to implement the state program at the expense of the National Fund of the Republic of Kazakhstan was supposed 770 086 663.0 thousand tenge, which were implemented through two formats:

1) direct government funding — 492 586 663 thousand tenge, including on the implementation of republican budget programs — 323 985 698 thousand tenge, targeted transfers 78 600 965.0 thousand tenge, budget loans — 90 million tenge, which executed in the amount of 491 947 836 thousand tenge. Unexecuted funds are remained in the amount of 638 827 thousand tenge.

Of these, local executive bodies (hereinafter LEB) in the form of targeted transfers and loan funds received 168 600 965 thousand tenge, the execution amounted to 166 579 211.3 thousand, including targeted transfers — 77 504 087.0 thousand tenge, budget credits — 89 075 124.3 thousand tenge. Unexecuted funds are remained in the amount of 2 021 753.7 thousand tenge.

2) to attract bond loan of Holding «Baiterek» in the amount of 277.5 million tenge, which performed in the amount of 215 119 000 thousand tenge. Unexecuted funds are remained in the amount of 62,381,000 tenge [6].

Thus, the program «Nurly Zhol» in two formats of funding (through the budget and through Holding «Baiterek») disbursed 707 billion tenge. 492 billion tenge have been financed through the budget. It was created 80 thousands of work places, constructed and reconstructed 456 km of roads, the sales of domestic production of vehicles was 4,540 units, purchased 28 passenger railway carriages «Talgo». The successful experience of 2015 has continued in the current year.

At the present time to assess the implementation of the state program provides a three-level control carried out by:

- 1) state authority — the developer in the form of monitoring;
- 2) authorized body on state planning in the form of evaluation;
- 3) Accounts Committee in the form of performance audit.

Evaluation of state programs carried out at the end of every three years for their implementation (intermediate) and at the end of the planning period (the final), except for the valuation carried out by the Accounts Committee, held in the framework of control activities in accordance with its work plan.

Budget Code of the Republic of Kazakhstan has clearly defined the nature of the ongoing Accounts Committee performance audit, submitted the assessment carried out, including on the basis of monitoring for compliance and financial reporting, the achievements of public authorities direct and final results of the implementation of the state, as well as a comprehensive and objective analysis of the impact of the activities of a public authority to development of the economy or individual sectors of the economy, social sphere and other spheres of government.

The final documents of the Audit Committee are opinions and orders, which contain both the positive results and the specific facts of shortcomings and violations, indicating the inefficiency of central government and executive bodies.

The main purpose of monitoring is to establish a cause-and-effect relationships identified deficiencies and violations. A clear definition of these reasons allows us to formulate an effective and reasonable way for the state program adjustments.

Depending on the program evaluation results in the conclusion formulated proposals to adjust the document program, volumes and sources of funding, including the optimization of resources and redistribution program, improve the activity of the central government and executive bodies, the change of the current legislation.

The results of the evaluation of public programs conducted by the Accounts Committee, sent to the Administration of the President of the Republic of Kazakhstan, the authorized body on state planning and the public agency responsible for the development of the state program.

Thus, the relationship of government strategy documents, government programs and strategic plans must actually lead to the following areas:

- Ensuring the implementation of programs and spending of budget funds due to the establishment of performance indicators and comparing actual progress with the planned;
- The establishment of the relationship between the expected results of the program and the amount of resources required;
- Increase the validity of the budget proposals of state bodies;
- More efficient allocation of budgetary resources among competing expenditure in accordance with the priorities of state policy;
- Increase the transparency and clarity of the budget, thereby increasing public confidence in the public authorities.

Summing up the results of the study it can be said that the effectiveness of the implementation of government programs play an important role in the sustainable development of the national economy. The effectiveness of the implementation of government programs depends not only on the magnitude of the economic effect, but primarily on social and political results of the activities of state bodies. To evaluate the effectiveness of government programs are necessary system evaluation technologies and procedures that have been sustainable, objective and allow timely adjustments to the activities of public authorities for the sustainable development of the national economy.

## References

- 1 О системе государственного планирования в Республике Казахстан. Указ Президента Республики Казахстан от 18 июня 2009 г. — № 827. — [ЭР]. Режим доступа: [www.adilet.zan.kaz](http://www.adilet.zan.kaz)
- 2 О некоторых вопросах дальнейшего функционирования Системы государственного планирования в Республике Казахстан. Указ Президента Республики Казахстан от 4 марта 2010 г. — № 931. — [ЭР]. Режим доступа: [www.adilet.zan.kaz](http://www.adilet.zan.kaz)
- 3 Об утверждении Перечня государственных программ. Указ Президента Республики Казахстан от 19 марта 2010 г. — № 957. — [ЭР]. Режим доступа: [www.adilet.zan.kaz](http://www.adilet.zan.kaz)
- 4 Послание Президента Республики Казахстан Н.Назарбаева народу Казахстана от 30 ноября 2015 г. «Казахстан в новой глобальной реальности: рост, реформы, развитие». — [ЭР]. Режим доступа: [www.akorda.kz](http://www.akorda.kz)
- 5 Тулеубекова А. Правительство для граждан поручил создать глава государства // Панорама. — 2015. — № 17. — 7 мая.
- 6 Пояснительная записка к отчету Правительства Республики Казахстан «Об исполнении республиканского бюджета за 2015 год». — [ЭР]. Режим доступа: <http://www.minfin.gov.kz>

Р.Е. Косдаулетова

### Ұлттық экономиканың тұрақты дамуындағы Қазақстан Республикасының мемлекеттік бағдарламаларының тиімділігі

Мақалада мемлекеттік жоспарлау жүйесі арқылы ұлттық экономиканың тұрақтылығын қамту ерекшеліктері қарастырылған. Стратегиялық құжаттар мен мемлекеттік бағдарламалардың өзара байланыс сипаты ашылған, олардың ұлттық экономика дамуын бағалау үшін қолдану мүмкіндіктері зерттелген. Еліміздің стратегиялық дамуының келешегін жүргізуге және ұлттық қауіпсіздікті қамтуға бағытталған Қазақстан Республикасы мемлекеттік бағдарламаларының жүргізу құралдары анықталған. Автор Қазақстан Республикасында жүзеге асып жатқан мемлекеттік бағдарламаларының тізімін талдаған, әзірленген мемлекеттік бағдарламалардың кеңінен таралған кемшіліктерін атап, осы проблемаларды шешу жолдарын ұсынған.

Р.Е. Косдаулетова

### Эффективность государственных программ Республики Казахстан в устойчивом развитии национальной экономики

Рассмотрены особенности обеспечения устойчивости развития национальной экономики с помощью системы государственного планирования. Раскрыт характер взаимосвязи стратегических документов и государственных программ, исследованы возможности их использования для оценки развития экономики страны. Определены инструменты реализации государственных программ Республики Казахстан, направленные на осуществление приоритетов стратегического развития и на обеспечение национальной безопасности. Проанализирован перечень действующих государственных программ Республики Казахстан, выявлены наиболее распространенные их недостатки и предложены пути решения проблем.

## References

- 1 About the system of state planning in the Republic of Kazakhstan. The Republic of Kazakhstan President's Decree dated on June, 18, 2009, 827, [www.adilet.zan.kaz](http://www.adilet.zan.kaz)
- 2 On some issues of further functioning of the state planning system in the Republic of Kazakhstan. Decree of the President of the Republic of Kazakhstan dated on March 4, 2010, 931. [www.adilet.zan.kaz](http://www.adilet.zan.kaz)
- 3 On approval of the list of government programs. The Decree of the President of the Republic of Kazakhstan dated on March 19, 2010, 957. [www.adilet.zan.kaz](http://www.adilet.zan.kaz)
- 4 The Address of the President of the Republic of Kazakhstan of Nursultan Nazarbayev to the people of Kazakhstan dated on November 30, 2015, «Kazakhstan in the new global reality: growth, reform, development», [ER]. Access mode: [www.akorda.kz](http://www.akorda.kz)
- 5 Tuleubekova A. *Panorama*, 2015, 17, May, 7.
- 6 The explanatory note to the report of the Government of the Republic of Kazakhstan «On the execution of the republican budget for 2015», [ER]. Access mode: <http://www.minfin.gov.kz>