

**D.N. Kelesbayev<sup>1\*</sup>, A.D. Bolganbayev<sup>2</sup>, K. Myrzabekkyzy<sup>3</sup>, G.T. Sultankhanova<sup>4</sup>**

<sup>1,2,3</sup> *Khoja Akhmet Yassawi International Kazakh-Turkish University, Kazakhstan*

<sup>1</sup>*dinmukhamed.kelesbayev@ayu.edu.kz*, <sup>2</sup>*artur.bolganbayev@gmail.com*, <sup>3</sup>*kundyz.myrzabekkyzy@ayu.edu.kz*

<sup>1</sup><http://orcid.org/0000-0002-4193-8121>, <sup>2</sup><https://orcid.org/0000-0001-8476-6975>,

<sup>3</sup><https://orcid.org/0000-0001-7207-4146>, <sup>4</sup><https://orcid.org/0000-0002-1358-1778>

<sup>1</sup>*Scopus Author ID: 56623085400*, <sup>2</sup>*Scopus Author ID: 57337279800*,

<sup>3</sup>*Scopus Author ID: 57336996800*, <sup>3</sup>*ResearcherID: P-2783-2017*

## **Development of Logistics Services in Kazakhstan and Evaluation of the Opinions of Logistics Company Managers with the Nvivo Program**

### **Abstract**

**Object:** This study aims to review the transportation sector in Kazakhstan; evaluate the current status and performance of logistics centers; and identify the main problems and root causes. Our research problem is to determine whether it is possible to establish a logistics center sufficient to meet the expectations of both the country and the logistics companies and, if possible, to determine the requirements of that center.

**Methods:** Interviews, NVivo package program, observation, document analysis, coding techniques.

**Results:** The qualitative analysis revealed the expectations of the sector representatives from a logistics center and the requirements that a center should meet to support the development of the sector and the country's economy. The fact that concepts such as logistics center, logistics, and logistics service are present in almost all interviews shows the sensitivity of the sector to the subject.

**Conclusions:** Kazakhstan can create an integrated complex that complies with international standards, can provide quality service for any goods in every direction and distance, and can provide all kinds of barrier-free transportation.

**Keywords:** logistics, logistics sector, logistics infrastructure, logistics services, logistics companies, transportation, Kazakhstan, NVivo package program.

### **Introduction**

Developing economic relations with other countries will allow Kazakhstan to enter the international division of labor, the global production chain, and the global economy as a full participant. Given the globalization and regionalization of the world economy, the success of economic reforms will largely depend on the effective development of these relations. Deepening economic relations between states also requires the creation of an advanced transportation system based on the formation and functioning of international transport corridors. International transportation corridors and routes create a network between logistics centers and create favorable conditions for investment projects. Therefore, the logistics potential of Kazakhstan, which is located on the historical Silk Road and at the crossroad of many modern transit corridors, is worth examining. As a country with rich underground resources, Kazakhstan has serious export and logistics potential. Despite having such a commercial advantage, Kazakhstan's logistics infrastructure is still in its infancy. This study examines why Kazakhstan cannot meet logistics expectations despite its strategic location. Our study provides examples of contemporary logistics and transportation practices, discusses logistics infrastructure and services, examines Kazakhstan's trade volume, and evaluates the past, present, and future of logistics in Kazakhstan. Then, Kazakhstan's logistics potential is analyzed in depth. It is identified that the logistics sector in Kazakhstan works mainly on land and rail transport, and its logistics infrastructure is still underdeveloped. First of all, Kazakhstan's transportation infrastructure should be renewed and developed for a fully functional logistics center.

### **Literature Review**

This section focuses on Kazakhstan's logistics infrastructure and logistics services, as well as the past, present, and future of its logistics industry. For this purpose, examples from the world and studies dealing with the role of the Kazakhstan logistics system in the global logistics system are examined. The review provided modern and objective data that allowed us to analyze the issues and summarize our aims.

Rana (2016) reviewed Kazakhstan's current transportation system, various problems of its logistics management system, and infrastructural problems. He suggested the development of multimodal transport

\* Corresponding author: E-mail address: *dinmukhamed.kelesbayev@ayu.edu.kz*

systems and resources and the use of government policies to create more efficient and effective transport systems. This article is an important resource for both the industry and researchers.

Omirebekova et al. (2017) examine the cooperation between Turkey and Kazakhstan within the framework of the development of international trade, transport, and logistics systems, and the possibilities for countries to expand their borders based on the principles of openness, equality, and mutual benefit. The logistics potential of Kazakhstan, which is located on important trade routes such as the historical Silk Road and still hosts many international transit land, rail, and air corridors, is worth examining. Despite having such a commercial advantage, Kazakhstan's logistics infrastructure is still in its infancy. Because the country has large lands, the cities are located at far distances from each other, and there are no facilities on the highways. Rehabilitation of railway and road transportation lines and the development of combined transportation systems will be effective in overcoming these problems. Kazakhstan and Turkey have positive perspectives on the construction of new transport lines, including transit. Kazakhstan can make a breakthrough and get ahead in the logistics sector by building iron and oil pipelines and renovating its refineries. This transportation line, which connects Asia and Europe via Turkey and the Caspian Sea, is expected to be faster and cheaper, offering the opportunity to become the world's largest trade and logistics center for both Turkey and Kazakhstan.

Mukhtarova et al. (2018) state that the high level of logistics development positively affects many socio-economic indicators such as inflation rates, productivity indicators, etc. Increasing productivity through logistics has a positive impact on competitiveness in global markets, as well as on profit. The authors analyzed the evolution of productivity in rail transport among several countries between 1997 and 2016. They used a non-parametric approach that allowed them to change the performance and efficiency of the transport infrastructure. The results indicate that productivity growth is concentrated in the last period (1997–2016) when most countries reformed their infrastructures. This increased productivity is mainly due to technical progress. They also analyzed the factors of effectiveness and justified that the higher the autonomy and financial independence, the higher the level of efficiency and technical change in the infrastructure of railway transport.

The work of Bolganbayev and Parilti (2019) contributes to the increasing role of Kazakhstan's transport and communication complex in the development of world trade and the realization of national interests. In many countries, logistics has long been a practical business tool, accounting for 20 to 30% of the gross national product (GNP) of the leading industrialized countries. Market conditions require rhythm, continuity, reliability, high-speed delivery, and minimum cost that enable the transportation industry to meet international standards, as well as consumer requirements. The obtained data obtained were interpreted using time series and regression analysis.

Bulatov et al. (2020) are novel in their presentation of a comprehensive engineering project that can be implemented by optimizing the existing components of the supply chain. Such tools can be based directly on the principles of engineering solutions and micro-logistics systems. An economic rationale has been put forward for the proposed system and its elements. This work can be extended with the application of decentralized logistics system technologies.

Śładkowski et al. (2020) focused on the inequality between the regional transportation services in Kazakhstan, the increased demand for logistics services, and the lack of logistics capacity. The authors suggested the Analytic Hierarchy Process (AHP) method to determine the most favorable sites for the construction of logistics centers in Kazakhstan.

Aislu et al. (2020) analyzed the mutual relations between economic, road, transport, and logistics indicators. In addition to the freight turnover between 1993 and 2017 in Kazakhstan, they conducted retrospective research on variables such as total road length, the number of transport companies, and GDP.

Gabdullina et al. (2020) explored how all transport modes (rail, river, sea, road, air, and pipeline) in Kazakhstan can be combined under a single transportation system. The authors determined that a range of socio-economic factors (economic development; multimodality; urban location; direction and strength of major transportation and economic relations; location of major resorts and tourist sites; need to optimize costs) must be considered for an effective supply chain management and transportation network. In addition, they analyzed supply chain management in the target region through innovation trends, intellectual capital, and organizational resources. The results showed that both multimodality and intellectual capital are positively and significantly associated with innovation in logistics services. However, the study found no evidence of a relationship between organizational resources and innovation in logistics services.

Bolganbayev et al. (2021) also tried to determine the relationship between the logistics sector and the Gross Domestic Product (GDP) and to examine the relationship between the changes in the logistics sector

data and the GDP. This relationship was analyzed using the X11-ARIMA/88 method and time series. Long-term coefficients and error correction model findings showed that there is a one-period lag in the relationship between X13\_SA and GDP variables, and the trend is statistically significant. A one-period lag and a statistically significant trend are found between X14\_SA and the GDP variable. A one-period lag and a statistically significant trend are found between X18\_SA and the GDP variable.

Raimbekov and Syzdykbayeva (2021) examined the link between logistics indicators and economic growth in Kazakhstan between 1995 and 2019. They revealed the reciprocal effects of various transport and economic growth indicators. They also identified that the economic growth in Kazakhstan, compared to other large economies, creates less demand for transport and logistics services, and suggested that road and maritime transport conditions should be improved to promote economic growth.

### ***Methodology***

In this study, in-depth structural interviews were conducted with company officials about both the logistics center and the general situation of the logistics industry. An interview form was prepared to collect the thoughts and statements of company managers. Therefore, the data were collected from the primary source. The data were analyzed using the QSR NVivo version 11 qualitative research package program. As a result, we obtained valuable information on the current situation of the logistics sector, the opinions of the companies, their predictions, and expectations from a logistics center.

This study employs a qualitative research model based on structured interviews with company executives. The scope consists of logistics companies already operating in Kazakhstan. Interview data were coded for analysis. Coding techniques are explained in the following headings. Qualitative data analysis helps researchers to organize the data, divide it into units of analysis, and to synthesize it. It also reveals important variables (Özdemir, 2014). Qualitative research uses information collection methods such as observation, interview, and document analysis, and aims to reveal perceptions and events in a natural environment realistically and holistically (Yıldırım, 1999).

Qualitative data analysis can be described as the process of obtaining analyzes related to the study area from verbally expressed text, opinions, and comments such as interviews, literature reviews, images, or website data. Operationally, qualitative research begins with the coding process. Coding is the process of assigning symbolic words or short sentences to research data for research purposes. The coding process is, on the one hand, the analysis itself, on the other hand, it is a specific and concrete process that initiates the analysis (Yalçın, 2018). Coding is an important process for grounded theory analysis and provides the link between data and conceptualization. The coding types are open coding, axis coding, and selective coding (Bryman and Burgess, 2002).

### ***Open Coding***

Open coding is the process of determining the words and concepts related to the study area from the text at the stage of obtaining the data. At this level, the codes are determined by carefully reading the text line by line. The purpose of this stage is to gather preliminary information to create concepts or categories (Strauss, 1987). In open coding, it is useful to review some interview files before starting coding. In this way, first impressions can be obtained. In addition, research codes can be determined more easily by pre-viewing important concepts related to the subject and creating a list (Punch, 2011).

### ***Axial Coding***

In axial coding, codes obtained by open coding are grouped by determining connections or relationships between them. In other words, words or concepts obtained in open coding are converted into clusters on certain axes (Punch, 2011). The keywords and concepts obtained in the open coding phase are clustered considering the theories of the research area and the general structure of the application area. At this stage, the concepts or words in the same cluster are expected to be closely related (Creswell, 2016).

### ***Selective Coding***

The third stage of the coding process is selective coding. At this stage, the codes obtained in axis coding are brought together at the level of certain central categories. Selective coding is constructed by reanalyzing the initial texts when necessary and reviewing the concepts and theories of the study area (Creswell, 2016). The most important contribution to the reporting stage of the research is the codes obtained at this stage. Thus, it is expected that the codes obtained by selective coding will have both the ability to express the main dimensions of the research problem and a structure that will provide ease of reporting and inter-

pretation. In other words, selective codes are expected to express independent dimensions of the main problem.

### ***Discussion and Results***

In this section, the answers of the company officials to the interview questions are evaluated and interpreted. Then, the obtained results by the coding method are evaluated.

Table 1. Summary information for logistics companies

Firm No.	Foundation Year	Number of Employees	Target Countries	Transportation Modes
1. Firm	2013	248	Kazakhstan, Belarus, CIS, Uzbekistan, China, Kyrgyzstan, Turkmenistan, Tajikistan, Russia, USA, Asia, and Europe	Road, Railway, Airline, Seaway, Multimode
2. Firm	2007	54	Kazakhstan, Russia, Belarus, China, and Kyrgyzstan	Road
3. Firm	2000	38	UAE, China, Kyrgyzstan, Turkey, and Russia	Road
4. Firm	2008	118	CIS, EU, South-West Asia, Iran, and Turkey	Road, Railway
5. Firm	2003	32	Kazakhstan, Russia, Belarus, Kyrgyzstan, and Uzbekistan	Road
6. Firm	1963	540	Asia, Europe, Near East, Iran, and Turkey	Seaway, Multimode
7. Firm	2008	68	Kazakhstan, Uzbekistan, China, Kyrgyzstan, Turkmenistan, Tajikistan, and Russia	Road, Railway, Airline, Multimode
8. Firm	2001	84	CIS, Russia, China, and Europe	Road, Railway
9. Firm	2005	26	China, Europe, Asia, and CIS	Road
10. Firm	2012	45	Kazakhstan and CIS	Road, Railway

*Note – Compiled by authors on the basis of research*

Considering the establishment dates of the companies included in the study, it is clear that most of them are established after the 2000s (See Table 1). The oldest is the 6th company established in 1963. It also has the largest number of employees. The lowest number of employees belongs to the 9th company. Central Asia and the CIS countries are at the forefront of the countries where these companies transport goods. Some companies provide logistics services to the Near East, Europe, the USA, and UAE. While there are companies that offer various options in terms of transport mode, road transport is more common. All of these companies provide road transport services. Moreover, the 1st, 4th, 7th, 8th, and 10th companies have railway transportation capacity; the 1st and 6th companies have sea transportation capacity; the 1st and 7th companies have air transportation capacity; and the 1st, 6th, and 7th companies have multimodal transportation capacity.

Interviews were held with the managers of the companies and data were obtained in the light of the answers given by asking the questions in Table 2.

Table 2. Interview questions

1.	What do you understand by the concept of a logistics center?
2.	What are the main features that a logistics center should have?
3.	What are the points to be considered in the establishment and operation of logistics centers?
4.	At what stage are the developments in logistics centers in our country?
5.	What are your most important problems in the logistics sector?
6.	Do you have a vehicle tracking system? How do you inform?
7.	Is authorization and quality certificate required?
8.	What kind of goods do you transport? What goods do you not transport?
9.	What types of vehicles do you have in your vehicle fleet? What are the dimensions of the vehicles?
10.	Do you carry out customs procedures for your export/import shipments?
11.	What do you think about a center that will meet all the needs of the business?

*Note – Compiled by authors on the basis of research*

Many of the companies we interviewed within the scope of the study reported that the main problems in the logistics sector of Kazakhstan are the lack of infrastructure and the inadequacy of transportation routes. Among the problems listed by the 1st, 2nd, 4th, 5th, 7th, 8th, and 9th companies, both are mentioned. In addition, the 1st, 2nd, 3rd, 7th, and 9th companies counted the low number of warehouses, especially the scarcity of A-class modern warehouses among the current problems. In addition, the 1st, 2nd, 4th, 7th, 8th, and 10th companies stated that another problem in the logistics sector is the shortage of trained personnel and experts. The 2nd, 3rd, 4th, and 7th companies count the low service quality among the existing problems. The 1st, 4th, and 10th companies stated that the logistics sector investments are insufficient, while the 5th company stated that the state support is low. The 1st, 4th, and 5th companies claim that the vehicles transporting goods do not comply with the old and international standards. The 4th, 6th, and 7th companies think that the technical equipment of the facilities is weak and does not comply with the standards. However, the 3rd company said that there is no multi-faceted service in the logistics centers and that there is no competition among the companies. While the 2nd company said that the internal communication between the logistics companies is insufficient, the 5th company also stated that there were deficiencies in informing the customers. The 6th company stated that there are irregularities in the planning and timing of the transportation of the goods and that the prices are also high. The 4th and 10th companies also counted the lack of statistical data in Kazakhstan among the problems.

The answers show that logistics companies do not carry only one type of goods, but also different types of products. The 1st, 3rd, 4th, 5th, and 6th companies stated that they can transport goods such as wagons, ships, aircraft parts, construction materials, construction equipment, drilling rigs, mining, and metallurgical products. The 1st, 3rd, 4th, and 8th companies stated that they also have the opportunity to transport liquid goods. In addition, the 1st and 8th companies stated that they can work on the transportation of dangerous, chemical, and radioactive materials. Unlike the others, the 1st company also carries "live" cargo, while the 7th company only transports the goods with declarations and documents (shoes, clothes, children's toys, cosmetics, furniture, electronic technology, electrical tools, etc.). The answers show that the 4th, 5th, 6th, and 10th companies also carry mineral fertilizers, animal feeds, agricultural products, and food. The 9th company carries ready-made products, consumer goods, cosmetics, and perfumes from the factory, and the 10th company carries cosmetics, tobacco, alcoholic products, pharmaceuticals, technological and electronic devices. The 2nd company stated that they transported all the goods that are not prohibited by the laws of Kazakhstan and that they do not carry illegal goods. The 5th company does not carry explosive and dangerous products. In addition, all companies stated that they carry out customs procedures for export and import transportation. The 1st, 5th, 7th, 9th, and 10th companies stated that they can assist their customers in obtaining various documents, insurance, and security as well as customs procedures. While the 6th, 7th, and 10th companies carry out their customs procedures through brokers, other companies can carry out these transactions with their staff.

Finally, all companies are positive about the establishment of a center where all their logistics needs will be met. Some also claimed that meeting all needs in one place would save time and money, and besides, such a center will provide convenience to customers. The 1st, 2nd, 3rd, 4th, 5th, and 7th companies declared a common idea that such a center should have various cars, car services, warehouses, dining hall, accommodation, weighing, packaging machines, health center, and all the necessary equipment. The 2nd, 3rd, 4th, 6th, 9th, and 10th companies stated that insurance, transportation, cargo, distribution, various permits, and customs procedures should be done in logistics centers. The 7th company, on the other hand, stated that to have a center that meets all needs, it is necessary to have expert staff trained in the field: "...It would be good for customers to be able to do all the work from a single center. If such a center exists, it should consist of the best-trained staff and the best companies in their field. He who knows his job well knows what is needed there. Therefore, first of all, the employees should be professional. They should be able to offer the most suitable vehicle and route options for national and international transportation of goods. It should have employees who will know which permits and authorization documents are needed for which products for the transportation of goods, who will inform them about the changes according to the country and region, and who will present competitive offers". The 8th company, on the other hand, thinks that a center where all needs are met is comforting and that companies will develop and grow rapidly: "Having a center that meets all their needs will relieve companies and make their work easier. I view the establishment of such a center positively. Some companies have been operating in our industry for a long time, newly established or providing limited

service. As you mentioned, a center enables these companies to grow and develop rapidly. The development of companies means the development of the logistics industry”. The answers of the companies interviewed within the scope of the study show that a logistics center should be established in Kazakhstan where all needs are met.

Now, we need to share the findings of the axis and open codes of the coding of data related to competition, development, and quality of companies.

Table 3. Axes and open codes related to selective coding on “competition, development of firms and quality-related evaluations”

<b>Evaluations on Competition, Development of Firms and Quality</b>
<b>Quality management and certificate</b> Quality certificate, ISO 9001, ISO 2200, OHSAS 18001, ISO 14001, TAPA, Quality standards, Service, Facility features
<b>Economic and Managerial benefits</b> Speeding things up, Cost reduction, Option - Time, Option - Transportation, Option - Price, Synergetic effect, Planning, Development, Logistics cost, Demand
<b>Competition and Development of Logistics Firms</b> Competition, Foreign partner, Investors, Supplier, Consumer, Supply chain, New business opportunities, Logistics performance index, Customer
<i>Note – Compiled by authors on the basis of research</i>

As the first selective coding theme, the contribution of the logistics center to the companies was extracted from the data of the companies. In this selective coding, 28 different open codes are defined under three axes (Table 3).

Table 4. Axes and open codes for selective coding on “evaluations regarding the logistics industry”

<b>Evaluations on the Logistics Sector</b>
<b>Vehicles and Transport System</b> Vehicle fleet, Wagon, Container, Refrigerated wagon, Truck, TIR, Crane, Forklift, Trailer, Tanker, vehicles
<b>Modes of Transportation</b> Seaway, Highway, Airway, Pipeline, Railroad, Maritime
<b>Technology and Communication Structure</b> Technology, Digital management, Information, Navigation tracking system, GLONASS, Information, Navitel, Navigation, Vehicle tracking system, Digital Kazakhstan, Intelligent transportation system, Communication information exchange, Cargo tracking system
<b>Transported Products and Their Features</b> Heavy industry, Radioactive, Toxic, Transported goods, Hazardous-military industrial products
<i>Note – Compiled by authors on the basis of research</i>

The second selective coding theme extracted from the data of the companies is the evaluations related to the logistics sector. In this selective coding, 35 different open codes are defined under four-axis coding (Table 4).

Table 5. Axes and explicit codes for selective coding on “legal actions and expectations from the State or government”

<b>Legal Action and Expectations from the State or Government</b>
<b>Legal Support</b> Customs transactions, Insurance transactions, Broker, Tax, Fee, Connection with official institutions, Legal transactions, Documentation, Risk insurance
<b>Solutions to the Problems and Needs of the Logistics Sector</b> Maintenance and repair of roads, Problems, Insufficient infrastructure, Support, Maintenance and repair, Security measures, CRM, Industrialization, Modernization, Hardware
<b>Relations with the State or Government</b> Customs union, Eurasian economic union, Transport permit, Potential, Document, Authorization document, Permit, Nurlijol
<i>Note – Compiled by authors on the basis of research</i>

The third selective coding theme extracted from firms' data is legal action and expectations from the state or government. In this selective coding, 28 different open codes are defined under three-axis coding (Table 5).

Table 6. Axes and explicit codes for selective coding on “Evaluations about the logistics center”

<b>Evaluations on the Logistics Center</b>	
<b>Human Resources and Personnel Structure</b>	Scientist, Expert, Employee, Expert and trained personnel, Human resources, Occupational Health and Safety
<b>Clustering</b>	Customs administration, Logistics, ATM, Financial centers, Cargo companies, Maintenance and repair services, Hotel, Health center, Clustering, Insurance, Facilities
<b>Logistics Network and Connections</b>	Logistics network, Access to international corridors, Transit roads, Intercity transportation, International transportation, Access road connection, Export, Import
<b>Features of the Logistics Center</b>	Modern warehouse, Quality of service, Class A warehouse, Versatile service, Multimodal transportation, Multimodal, Location, Infrastructure, Discipline, Emergency response, Search and rescue, Parking lot, Equipment, Coordinator, Operation
<b>Features of the Location of the Logistics Center</b>	Population density, Industrial zones, Regional development, Traffic density, Customs, Logistics center, Warehousing
<i>Note – Compiled by authors on the basis of research</i>	

The fourth selective coding theme extracted from the data of the companies is the evaluations about the logistics center. In this selective coding, 47 different open codes are defined under five-axis coding (Table 6).

Table 7. Statistics on coding according to the companies participating in the research

Interview File	Number of Codes Obtained with Open Coding	Number of Codes Obtained with Axis Coding	Number of Codes Obtained by Selective Coding
1. Firm	143	71	4
2. Firm	91	50	4
3. Firm	85	43	4
4. Firm	103	59	4
5. Firm	85	44	4
6. Firm	72	45	4
7. Firm	96	55	4
8. Firm	64	45	4
9. Firm	78	52	4
10. Firm	88	52	4
TOTAL	905	516	40
<i>Note – Compiled by authors on the basis of research</i>			

The analysis findings of the interview data of each enterprise are summarized in Table 7. At the open coding level, the highest number of codes were detected in the 1st and 4th enterprises. All of the selector code statements were also observed in all company interviews. According to these results, the main evaluation areas related to the logistics center consist of the four selective codes mentioned above.

### **Conclusions**

The transportation sector is important for Kazakhstan and it is a rapidly developing sector in its economy. Some modes of transport are characterized by monopoly or oligopoly (air transport, rail, and pipeline transport), while others (road and water transport) are characterized by competition. In this context, a comprehensive analysis of Kazakhstan's logistics infrastructure is made and its potential and features of providing and maintaining worldwide goods flows are determined. According to the results, the main evaluation areas related to the logistics center consist of the four selective codes determined above. In other words, the problems that the sector companies expect during the establishment of the logistics center and their expectations after the logistics center is established can be expressed with the following items.

i. The logistics center should contribute to the competitiveness of the companies and the quality of the sector.

- ii. The center must be compatible with the general structure of the logistics industry.
- iii. The logistics center should facilitate companies' legal transactions and meet their expectations from the state or government.
- iv. The logistics center should be sufficient (similar to other country practices) in terms of factors such as clustering, international connectivity, or physical characteristics.

The analysis of the structured interviews provided these results:

1. The open coding level analysis shows that companies know and use more than a hundred concepts or key phrases. This shows that the sector has a high interest in the logistics center, that they closely follow the developments in this field, and that their level of knowledge is high.

2. The axis coding level analysis revealed the dimensions that can be interpreted as the general framework related to the logistics center. As a result, the basic objectives, principles and values, operating policy, services to be fulfilled, vision and mission principles of the logistics center are determined.

3. In the analysis at the selective coding level, four main dimensions related to the logistics center were obtained.

a. Businesses mostly cared about the dimension of evaluations about the logistics center. Under this dimension, businesses generally expressed their views on the center's human resources and personnel structure, clustering, logistics network, connections, features, and location.

b. Other dimensions are;

- Evaluations on Competition, Development of Firms and Quality,
- Evaluations of the Logistics Sector,
- Legal Action and Expectations from the State or Government.

4. When we evaluated the structured interviews in general, we saw that the enterprises had some thoughts about the operation, location, duties, authorities, and responsibilities of the center. We consider that it would be beneficial to conduct new research to reveal these thoughts in more detail and to obtain information that will contribute to the establishment of the center. These studies can be in-depth interviews or focus group meetings on the selective coding information obtained, as well as in the form of structured questionnaires. In addition, ensuring the participation of other stakeholders in new studies will be complementary to this research. In this sense, state/government officials, mid-level workers/employees working in the enterprise, companies receiving service from the sector, and local government representatives can be considered stakeholders.

To sum up, we determined that by successfully applying a global experience such as establishing a logistics center, Kazakhstan can create an integrated complex that complies with international standards, can provide quality service for any goods in any direction and at any distance, and can provide all kinds of barrier-free transportation.

## References

- Aislu, T., Bagdat, T., Loprensipe, G., & Nailya, I. (2020). Analysis of enterrelation between economic, road, transport and logistic indicators. *News of the National Academy of Sciences of the Republic of Kazakhstan, Series of Geology and Technical Sciences*, 2(440), 162–169.
- Bolganbayev, A., & Parıltı, N. (2019). Kazakistan'da Taşımacılık Sektöründeki Gelişmelerle Gayri Safi Milli Hasıla (GSMH) Arasındaki İlişki. *Third Sector Social Economic Review*, 54(1), 626–637.
- Bolganbayev, A.D., Myrzabekkyzy, K., Kelesbayev, D.N., & Baimaganbetov, S.T. (2021). The Importance of Logistics Center Application for Development of Goods Transportation and Research on Kazakhstan. *Bulletin of the Karaganda University. Economy series*, 4(104), 13–26.
- Bryman, A., & Burgess, R.G. (2002). *Analyzing Qualitative Data*. This edition published in the Taylor & Francis e-Library. Routledge: London.
- Bulatov, N.K., Balabaev, O.T., Arpabekov, M.I., & Bobeev, A.B. (2020). Formation of a transport and logistics center within the boundaries of a transitive economy. *Research in Transportation Business & Management*, 37(1), 100556.
- Creswell, J.W. (2016). *Nitel Araştırma Yöntemleri*. (Üçüncü Baskı). Ankara: Siyasal Kitabevi, 97–288.
- Gabdullina, L., Kirdasinova, K., Amanbayeva, A., Zeinullina, A., Tlessova, E., & Azylkanova S.A. (2020). Transport and logistics innovations in supply chain management: Evidence from Kazakhstan. *Uncertain Supply Chain Management*, 8(2), 255–266.
- Omirebekova, R., Myrzabekova, M., & Sartayeva, K. (2017). Türkiye ve Kazakistan Lojistik Sistemlerinin Gelişim Perspektifleri. *The International New Issues in Social Sciences*, 5(5), 435–452.
- Özdemir, M. (2014). Nitel Veri Analizi: Sosyal Bilimlerde Yöntembilim Sorunsalı Üzerine Bir Çalışma. *Eskişehir Osmangazi Üniversitesi Sosyal Bilimler Dergisi*, 11(1), 323- 343.
- Punch, K.F. (2011). *Sosyal Araştırmalara Giriş*. (İkinci Baskı). Ankara: Siyasal Kitabevi.

- Raimbekov, Z., & Syzdykbayeva, B. (2021). Assessing the impact of transport and logistics on economic growth in emerging economies: a case study for the conditions of the Republic of Kazakhstan. *Transport Problems*, 16(2), 199–211.
- Rana, K. (2016). Transportation in Kazakhstan and its Economic Implications. *International Journal of Business and Applied Social Science*, 2(1), 11–20.
- Mukhtarova, S.K., Ospanov, S.S., Antoni, A., & Sharapiyeva, M.D. (2018). The evaluation of the efficiency of transport and logistics infrastructure of railway transport. *Pomorstvo*, 32(1), 88–101.
- Śladkowski, A., Teltayev, B., & Izteleuova, M. (2020). Multi-criteria choice of the region for the construction of a logistics center based on AHP: case study for Kazakhstan. *Transport Problems*, 15(2), 119–131.
- Strauss, A.L. (1987). *Qualitative Analysis For Social Scientists*. Cambridge: Cambridge University Press.
- Yalçın, A. (2018). Küresel Doğan İşletmelerin Uluslararasılaşma Sürecine Etki Eden Girişimcilik Yöneliminde Yenilikçilik Boyutu. Doktora Tezi, Gazi Üniversitesi Sosyal Bilimler Enstitüsü, Ankara.
- Yıldırım, A. (1999). Nitel Araştırma Yöntemlerinin Temel Özellikleri ve Eğitim Araştırmalarındaki Yeri ve Önemi. *Eğitim ve Bilim Dergisi*, 23(112), 7–17.

**Д.Н. Келесбаев, А.Д. Болғанбаев, Қ. Мырзабекқызы, Г.Т. Сұлтанханова**  
**Қазақстандағы логистикалық қызметтерді жетілдіру және логистикалық компания менеджерлерінің пікірлерін Nvivo бағдарламасы арқылы бағалау**

**Аңдатпа**

*Мақсаты:* Мақала Қазақстанның көлік саласына шолу жасауға, логистикалық орталықтардың ағымдағы жағдайы мен жұмысын бағалауға, негізгі мәселелер мен олардың себептерін анықтауға бағытталған. Зерттеудің негізгі міндеті — ел мен сектор компанияларының Қазақстандағы дамып келе жатқан логистика секторынан талапқа сай логистикалық орталық құру мүмкін бе, мүмкін болса, логистикалық орталық қандай сипаттамаларға ие болуы керек екенін анықтау.

*Әдісі:* Бұл зерттеудің негізгі моделі компания менеджерлерімен құрылымдық сұхбатқа негізделген сапалық зерттеу болып табылады. Зерттеу саласы ретінде Қазақстандағы логистикалық сала қамтылған. Сапалық зерттеудің аясы елімізде жұмыс істейтін логистикалық компаниялар болып табылады. Компания басшыларының бағалаулары мен талдауларын алу үшін сұхбат парағы дайындалып, осы формаға сәйкес басшылардың мәлімдемелері жазылды. Алынған ақпарат Nvivo сапалық зерттеу бағдарламасының көмегімен талданды.

*Қорытынды:* Сапалы талдау нәтижесінде логистикалық орталықтан сала өкілдеріне қойылатын талаптар және сала мен ел экономикасының дамуын қолдау тұрғысынан олардың біліктілігі анықталды. Іскерлік сұхбаттардың барлығында дерлік логистикалық орталық, логистика және логистикалық қызмет сияқты ұғымдардың бірінші орынға шығуы сектордың тақырыпқа деген сезімталдығын көрсетті.

*Тұжырымдама:* Логистикалық орталық құрудың әлемдік тәжірибесін сәтті қолданып келе жатқан Қазақстанның халықаралық стандарттарға сәйкес барлық бағытта, барлық қашықтықтағы кез келген тауар үшін сапалы қызмет көрсетуге қауқары бар екендігі, сондай-ақ кедергісіз тасымалдаудың барлық түрін қамтамасыз ете алатын кешенді құра алатындығы анықталды.

*Кілт сөздер:* логистика, логистикалық сектор, логистикалық инфрақұрылым, логистикалық қызметтер, логистикалық компаниялар, тасымалдау, Қазақстан, Nvivo бағдарламасы.

**Д.Н. Келесбаев, А.Д. Болғанбаев, К. Мырзабекқызы, Г.Т. Сұлтанханова**

**Развитие логистических услуг в Казахстане и оценка мнений менеджеров логистических компаний с помощью программы Nvivo**

**Аннотация**

*Цель:* Данное исследование направлено на обзор транспортной отрасли Казахстана, оценку текущего состояния и работы логистических центров, выявление основных проблем и их причин. Основная задача исследования — выяснить, возможно ли создание логистического центра, отвечающего ожиданиям страны и компаний сектора от развивающегося сектора логистики в Казахстане, и если возможно, то какими характеристиками должен обладать логистический центр.

*Методы:* Основной моделью данного исследования является качественное исследование, основанное на структурированном интервью с менеджерами компании. Он охватывает логистическую отрасль в Казахстане как область исследования. Сферой качественного исследования являются логистические компании, работающие в стране. Была подготовлена форма интервью для получения оценок менеджеров компании, и заявления менеджеров были записаны в соответствии с этой формой. Полученная информация была проанализирована с помощью пакета качественных исследований NVivo.

*Результаты:* В результате качественного анализа были выявлены требования к представителям отрасли от логистического центра и их квалификации с точки зрения поддержки развития отрасли и экономики страны.

Преобладание таких понятий, как логистический центр, логистика и логистические услуги практически во всех деловых интервью, показывает чувствительность сектора к этой теме.

*Выводы:* Установлено, что Казахстан, успешно применивший мировой опыт создания логистического центра, способен оказывать качественные услуги для любых грузов во всех направлениях, на всех расстояниях, а также может создать интегрированный комплекс, способный обеспечить все виды безбарьерных перевозок в соответствии с международными стандартами.

*Ключевые слова:* логистика, логистический сектор, логистическая инфраструктура, логистические услуги, логистические компании, транспорт, Казахстан, программа Nvivo.

Букеетов Университет